

THE EFFECTS OF REBEL PARTIES ON GOVERNANCE, DEMOCRACY AND STABILITY AFTER CIVIL WARS

FROM GUNS TO GOVERNING

Edited by John Ishiyama and Gyda Sindre



Publisher information is available here

1. Introduction: Rebel group inclusion and post-war democratisation

John Ishiyama and Gyda M. Sindre

The introductory chapter provides an overview of the book's overarching contribution to the literature on rebel group successor parties and politics after civil war. It introduced the main questions that the authors tackle in their respective chapters, i.e. how does rebel group political inclusion impact on governance, democracy and/or political stability after civil war. The chapter also clarifies how these questions engages with broader debates about peacebuilding, democratisation and regime change following the end of civil war. The final section of the chapter provides a summary of each individual chapter and how the authors have approached the main thematic questions raised by this volume.

Part 1: Rebel group inclusion and good governance

2. The Effects of Rebel Parties on Governance: Organizational Endowments, Ideology, and Governance after Civil Wars End

John Ishiyama and Michael Christopher Marshall

Does the type of rebel party that is included in the post-civil war political process affect governance practices? Unlike previous work that examines the transformation of rebel groups into parties, we examine the "downstream" effects of inclusion of former rebel parties. In this paper we examine whether rebel group endowments (both resources and social) and ideology impact government performance when such parties are included in government after civil wars end. We find that if parties that emerged from groups that relied on resource capture are

included in government, there will be less emphasis on "rule of law" and less "effective" governance (i.e. more corruption), although we also find no connection between the ideological origins of a party and quality of governance.

3. Dynamics of post-rebel party governance in Aceh and East Timor: Balancing patronage politics and popular democracy

Gyda M. Sindre

To what extent has rebel group inclusion into formal politics produced good governance? Given that many rebel groups attracted popular legitimacy in their opposition to corrupt regimes and lack of development, to what extent do rebel group successor parties deliver on their promises of transformative politics? This chapter analyses this question in the context of Southeast Asia, where politics is generally characterized by money politics, corruption and inefficient governance provision. It compares the rebel group successor parties in Indonesia's Aceh province and East Timor, two contexts where electoral democracy has become the only game in town, but that suffers from low development indicators. The chapter shows that while in both contexts, former rebels have designed and passed legislation about transformative politics the governments have only to varying degrees delivered on these promises. In Aceh, former rebels have expanded the rent-seeking apparatus in the region that is limited to the former rebel organization. In East Timor, rent seeking is mixed with expansion of welfare provisions that are also limited to membership in the armed struggle.

4. From 'Rebel Justice' to the 'Rule-of-Law': The cases of Hamas and Hezbollah

Benedetta Berti

The 'rule of law'—intended as 'the formal elements necessary for a system of law to exist' and the substantive content of that system, along with the normative nature of the authority promulgating laws—has been long described a key indicator of 'good governance' (World Bank, 1992, p. 30). The ability to build and administer a procedurally and substantially 'fair' justice system is a litmus test for the provision of good governance, especially in post-civil war contexts. The chapter examines the relationship between rebel group inclusion into politics and good governance by focusing on how these groups relate to the 'rule of law,' both conceptually and practically. It does so by examining Hamas's and Hezbollah's simultaneous institutional and extra-institutional role in the administration of justice, settlement of disputes and broader provision of law of order, examining these groups' impact on the political system.

5. The Struggle for Political Stability and Governance in Northern Ireland after the Peace Process: The role of Sinn Féin and the IRA

Matthew Whiting

Drawing on case of Sinn Féin and the IRA, this chapter asks how the legacy of being a rebel group effects former rebels in power and what is the impact of the inclusion of former rebels on political stability? It argues that two factors inherent to the nature of Irish republicanism's

rebel-to-party transformation had lasting legacies that inhibit effective politics in Northern Ireland today, even twenty years after the peace agreement. Firstly, Irish republicanism never moderated its core ethno-national values and goals, only its behaviour. Secondly, as a result of the peace process there is a fundamental contestation over the nature of democracy in Northern Ireland. These two factors trickle over into many aspects of everyday politics, leading to political conflict, recurring crises, and unstable government. But there are also issues unrelated to the legacy of the conflict, such as austerity politics, that cause crises and we should be cautious about assuming all tension in Northern Ireland today derives from the radical legacy of Irish republicanism.

6. The KLA successor parties and the spoils of peace in Kosovo

Stephan Hensell

The process of post-war democratisation in Kosovo has produced mixed results. Multi-party competition, relatively free and fair parliamentary elections and a stable party system have ensured that democracy has become the only game in town. However, political deadlock between the dominating political parties, short-lived governments and electoral volatility indicate that democratic stability is evolving only slowly. This chapter argues that the transformation of the Kosovo Liberation Army (KLA) into political parties and governments has contributed to a patrimonial form of rule in Kosovo. While the former rebels do not challenge democratic institutions, practices of appropriation have become the central mode of reproduction for the new political elites. The opening up of the political space in Kosovo has thus remained limited. The result is a political regime in which the competition for spoils plays a central role and the state apparatus is continuously seized by partisan interests.

Part 2: Rebel group inclusion and democracy

7. How does the inclusion of post-rebel parties shape democracy? Parties, elections and peace in Mozambique, 1992-2018

Carrie Manning

How does the inclusion of post-rebel parties in electoral politics shape democracy in post-conflict countries? In this chapter, I explore the mechanisms through which participation in regular, periodic elections over repeated electoral cycles may support or undermine democratic consolidation, using an in-depth longitudinal case study of Mozambique. This chapter makes three important claims. First, despite the breakdown of the 1992 peace settlement and the recurrence of conflict between Renamo and the Frelimo government from 2013-18, elections have continued to serve as an essential, though not sufficient, mechanism for the resolution of elite conflict in Mozambique. Second, the 1992 peace agreement created a particular party system – a bipolar system with strong partisan boundaries and marked asymmetry between the two major players, Renamo and the longtime ruling party Frelimo. Finally, electoral politics sets in motion dynamics and outcomes that cannot be predicted *a priori* from institutions or from actors' past behavior.

8. The Political Integration of Islamist Armed Groups: A Viable Path to Peace and Democracy?

Dino Krause and Mimmi Söderberg Kovacs

Is the political integration of Islamist armed groups into the constitutional system as legitimate political parties a viable mechanism for promoting peace and democracy? This chapter takes a closer look at fourteen cases of Islamist rebel-to-party transformations carried out in the time period 1975–2018 and examines the effects on these groups' peaceful and democratic behaviour. We find that Islamist armed groups which agreed to fully disband their armed wings largely adhered to principles of non-violence. We also find that most parties behaved highly pragmatic in cooperating with non-Islamist political parties, although this did not always reflect more substantive processes of ideological change. In line with this, while some parties moderated their demands for Sharia-based legislation, some did not. There also appears to be an overlap between those parties formulating far-ranging demands for sharia-based law and those promoting positions at odds with the protection of basic human rights principles.

9. Adapting too well? Rebel reconversion and democratization in El Salvador

Ralph Sprenkels

An oft-cited success story of post-settlement inclusion, this chapter focuses on the internal dynamics of the the Frente Farabundo Martí para la Liberación Nacional (FMLN's) war-to-peace adaptation process, and on the effects of this process for democratisation in El Salvador. Using internal FMLN documents, this article demonstrates how FMLN designed specific reconversion strategies to reshape the movement for post-war challenges. Reconversion strategies and their outcomes, combined with how political rival ARENA responded to FMLN electoral ascendency, fuelled electoral polarization and re-enforced democratic deficits like clientelism and authoritarianism. Focusing mainly on if and how the FMLN's post war inclusion enhanced overall democratic representation, and in a lesser degree on how rebel inclusion impacted on governance practices, this chapter concludes that the FMLN adapted so well to what political scientist Terry Karl called Salvadoran 'electoralism' that it hampered the quality of its potential contribution to deepening democracy.

10. Post-War Ruling Parties and their Youth Wings: How Old Rebels handle the African Millennials

Lovise Aalen, Aslak Orre, and Ragnhild L. Muriaas

Youth wings are crucial for political recruitment. But how do rebel-to-government parties relate to this section of their party structure? This chapter examines the role of youth wings in post-war politics in Ethiopia, Mozambique, and Uganda. In all countries, youth were an important part of the struggle, but as the rebel-to-government parties transformed into dominant party states the character of youth involvement differed. We demonstrate that even if the three cases all are examples of post-war authoritarian party rule, they represent different wartime and post-war trajectories and have mobilised distinctive constituency groups during

the struggle and in the immediate post-war period. In Uganda and Mozambique youth were early identified as a group that should be politically organized, while youth were neither represented in political structures nor in party youth wings at the time of transition in Ethiopia.

11. Rebel Participation and Political Transition in Post-War Sri Lanka

Shama Ams

This chapter addresses how rebel group inclusion affects democracy in Sri Lanka by arguing that since the end of the country's civil war in 2009, former Liberation Tamil Tigers of Eelam (LTTE) cadres appear to have been able to transform a political agenda predicated on violent rebellion into one predicated on democratic activism. The chapter explores how, since its creation in 2001, the Tamil National Alliance (TNA) has absorbed former LTTE cadres into its ranks, and subsequently, helped to shape the regional, domestic, and international political landscape concerning Sri Lanka's civil war and its aftermath. In turn, through the twin criteria of accountability and governance, the chapter draws upon local reports as well as other qualitative and quantitative data to evaluate the effect of political participation among former LTTE cadres within the TNA, other Tamil parties, as well as the broader Tamil community in Sri Lanka.

Part 3: Rebel group inclusion and political stability

12. Political Parties in De Facto States: Links with External Patrons

Nina Caspersen

Almost all de facto states owe their existence and their continued survival to support from external patrons. However, the resulting dependence, and sometimes interference, could impact negatively on their claims to democratisation. Through case studies of Abkhazia, Nagorno Karabakh and Northern Cyprus, this chapter examines how this link between former rebels and their patron states affects their ability to provide good and effective governance and its impact on the quality of post-war democracy. It finds significant patron state dependence in all three cases which impacts on political competition. While patron support is an important resource in the political competition, there are few direct links between the local political parties and the patron. Similarly, there are only a few examples of direct intervention in the electoral process, and such involvement can backfire. Despite constraints and more covert forms of influence, it is not therefore a straight choice between governance and democracy.

13. The Ethiopian People's Revolutionary Democratic Front: Coalition Dynamics and Post-War Politics

Terrence Lyons

The Ethiopian People's Revolutionary Democratic Front (EPRDF) ruled Ethiopia from 1991, when it won a protracted civil war, until it was disbanded and replaced by a successor party, the Prosperity Party (PP), in 2019. While initially dominated by the battle-hardened Tigray

People's Liberation Front (TPLF), the EPRDF also operated as a coalition of increasingly strong constituent parties and with robust intra-coalition competition. In 2018, after a period of prolonged popular protests, new leaders promised an era of political reforms. War with the TPLF, arrests of opposition leaders, and an election in 2021 in which the ruling PP won over 90 percent of the seats indicated that past authoritarian practices remained deeply embedded. The Ethiopian case illuminates the roles of victorious insurgents in forming post-war governments but also points to the importance of inclusion, intra-party competition, and the endurance of authoritarian practices despite the creation of a new ruling party.

14. Contingency, Inclusion, and Democracy: A Critical Analysis of Jamyat-e- Islami in the Afghan State Building Process

Wahid Watanyar

Post-conflict societies require a broad inclusion of key political players in order to strengthen democratic process and ensure stability. One of the crucial assumptions guiding inclusion is that democratisation would allow parties to address conflicts at the procedural level. This chapter provides a case study to empirically address the question of rebel group inclusion and examine its impact on the democratisation process in Afghanistan in the period. This chapter's focus is Jamyat-e-Islami Afghanistan (JIA) party. JIA was founded in 1973 and played a crucial role both during the Soviet occupation (1979-1989) and in the Afghan Civil War (1992-2001). After an initial political struggle, the party resorted to militancy. After 2001, it joined the Afghan democratic process as a political party. The central argument of this chapter is that JIA's origins and wartime experiences, and its reliance on a decentralised warlord structure have carried over into the post-war period. Thus, the inclusion of JIA into the political process hinders democratisation. In other words, from the perspective of democratization, inclusion is not necessarily a good thing, and the inclusion of warlord parties has not helped build democracy in Afghanistan.

15. Virtual Politics, post-Islamism and authoritarian Inertia in post-conflict Tajikistan

Tim Epkenhans

The peace accord after the Civil War (1992-1997) in Tajikistan was concluded between two groups of militias that are usually subsumed as 'government' and 'opposition'. The agreement stipulated the integration of the opposition into the post-conflict government and the transition to a liberal post-conflict political order. Within the opposition, the most influential group was the Islamic Revival Party of Tajikistan (IRPT), an Islamist political party that mobilized armed militias during the conflict. The particular parameters of the post-conflict arrangements in Tajikistan eventually facilitated the transformation of the IRPT from a civil war militia to a post-Islamist political party that centred its political agenda on democratisation, the participation in elections, post-conflict rehabilitation, good governance and transparency. Responding to the 'virtual politics' of the authoritarian government and international discourses on Islamist political activism after 9/11, the IRPT reduced its political agenda to a mildly conservative Islamic morality blended with Tajik nationalism, ultimately limiting its political relevance in Tajikistan and contributing – through its conciliatory acceptance of the post-conflict virtual politics – to the authoritarian inertia in the country since then.

16. Conclusion: Towards a theory of rebel group inclusion and democratisation

John Ishiyama and Gyda Sindre

The concluding chapter moves towards developing a theory regarding how different types of rebel parties impact governance, democracy, and stability. First, it suggests that different types of rebel parties, often defined by their organisational legacies, affect whether these parties will be a positive or negative force in politics after civil war. Second, it highlights how conflicts end as well as the political environment that former rebel parties operate within, also explain their relative impact in shaping post-war politics. Rebel group political inclusion, we suggest, has a positive impact on stability and possibly on governance, but is less convincing when it comes to deepening or improving the quality of democracy.